



PATENT APPLICATION  
Docket No: 15436.249.1.2.1

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re application of: Xie et al. )  
Serial No: 09/944,593 ) Art Unit  
Filed: August 31, 2001 ) 2872  
Confirmation No.: 1721 )  
For: COMPACT POLARIZATION INSENSITIVE )  
CIRCULATORS WITH SIMPLIFIED STRUCTURE )  
AND LOW POLARIZATION MODE DISPERSION )  
Examiner: Lee A. Fineman )

COMMENTS ON STATEMENT OF REASONS FOR ALLOWANCE

Mail Stop Issue Fee  
Commissioner for Patents  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Dear Sir:

Applicant respectfully disagrees with the Examiner's statement of reasons for allowance as set forth in the communication mailed on July 2, 2004. The Applicant concurs with the Examiner's conclusion that the prior art does not suggest or render obvious the claimed invention. However, Applicant submits that it is the claim as a whole, rather than any particular limitation, that makes each of the claims in the above-identified application allowable. No single limitation should be construed as the reason for allowance of a claim because it is each of the elements of the claim that distinguish the claim from the prior art and make it allowable.

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: 30 September 2004

By: *Eric L. Maschoff*  
ERIC L. MASCHOFF  
Attorney for Applicant  
Registration No. 36,596  
Customer No. 022913



PATENT APPLICATION  
Docket No.: 15436.249.1.2.1

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re application of:

Xie et al.

Serial No: 09/944,593

) Art Unit  
) 2872

Confirmation No.: 1721

)

Filed: August 31, 2001

)

For: COMPACT POLARIZATION INSENSITIVE  
CIRCULATORS WITH SIMPLIFIED STRUCTURE  
AND LOW POLARIZATION MODE

)  
)  
)

Examiner: Lee A. Fineman

)

CERTIFICATE OF DEPOSIT UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 1.8

I hereby certify that following documents are being deposited with the United States Postal Service as First Class Mail, postage prepaid, in an envelope addressed to: Box: Mail Stop Issue Fee, Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450, on this 30<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2004.

- o Transmittal of Issue Fee (2 pages) (in duplicate)
- o Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance
- o PTO Form PTOL-85B transmitting payment of Issue Fee and Publication Fee
- o PTO-2038 Credit Card Payment Form for \$1,633.00
- o Postcard

Respectfully submitted,

ERIC L. MASCHOFF  
Attorney for Applicant  
Registration No. 36,596  
Customer No. 022913  
Telephone: (801) 533-9800

RICK D. NYDEGGER  
BRENT P. LORIMER  
THOMAS R. VUKSINICH  
LARRY R. LAYCOCK  
JONATHAN W. RICHARDS  
DAVID R. WRIGHT  
JOHN C. STRINGHAM  
JOHN M. GUYNN  
CHARLES L. ROBERTS  
DANA L. TANGREN  
ERIC L. MASCHOFF  
CHARLES J. VEVERKA  
ROBYN L. PHILLIPS  
RICHARD C. GILMORE \*  
STERLING A. BRENNAN \*  
R. BURNS ISRAELSEN  
DAVID R. TODD  
GREGORY M. TAYLOR  
DAVID B. DELLENBACH  
L. DAVID GRIFFIN  
ADRIAN J. LEE  
FRASER D. ROY  
CARL T. REED



R. PARRISH FREEMAN, JR.  
PETER F. MALEN, JR.  
L. REX SEARS, PH.D.  
WILLIAM R. RICHTER  
ERIC M. KAMERATH  
ROBERT E. AYCOCK  
JENS C. JENKINS  
KEVIN W. STINGER  
WILLIAM J. ATHAY  
MICHAEL B. DODD  
RYAN D. BENSON  
SARA D. JONES  
TIGE KELLER  
JANNA L. JENSEN  
MATTHEW D. TODD  
J. LAVAR OLDHAM  
MICHAEL J. FRODSHAM  
JOSEPH L. KRUPA  
BRETT A. HANSEN  
BRETT I. JOHNSON  
MATTHEW A. BARLOW  
WESLEY C. ROSANDER  
ANDREW S. HANSEN  
CHAD E. NYDEGGER  
JOSEPH G. PIA  
CLINTON E. DUKE  
DAVID J. LORENZ †



**WORKMAN | NYDEGGER**  
INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY ATTORNEYS

1000 EAGLE GATE TOWER  
60 EAST SOUTH TEMPLE  
SALT LAKE CITY, UTAH 84111  
TELEPHONE: (801) 533-9800  
FAX: (801) 328-1707  
WEBSITE: [HTTP://WWW.WNLAW.COM](http://www.wnlaw.com)

**PATENT APPLICATION**  
Docket No: 15436.249.1.2.1

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

In re application of:

Xie et al.

Serial No: 09/944,593

) Art Unit

) 2872

Confirmation No.: 1721

)

Filed: August 31, 2001

)

For: COMPACT POLARIZATION  
INSENSITIVE CIRCULATORS WITH  
SIMPLIFIED STRUCTURE AND LOW  
POLARIZATION MODE

)

)

)

Examiner: Lee A. Fineman

)

**TRANSMITTAL OF ISSUE FEE PAYMENT**

Mail Stop Issue Fee  
Commissioner for Patents  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Sir:

In response to the Notice of Allowance and Issue Fee Due dated July 2, 2004, please find enclosed herewith the following items for filing in the United States Patent and Trademark Office in connection with the above identified patent application:

Issue Fee Transmittal (PTOL-85B) submitted pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 1.311.

- Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance.
- A Certificate of Deposit Under 37 C.F.R. § 1.8 is enclosed.
- PTO-2038 Credit Card Payment Form for \$1,633.00 is enclosed to cover:
  - The \$1,330.00 government issue fee pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 1.18.
  - The \$300.00 government publication fee pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 1.18.(d)
  - The \$3.00 fee for one (1) copy of the patent when issued.
- The Commission is hereby authorized to charge payment of any additional fees or credit any overpayment to Deposit Account No. 23-3178.
- A duplicate copy of this letter is enclosed.

Please address all future correspondence in connection with the above-identified patent application to the attention of the undersigned.

Dated this 30<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2004.

Respectfully submitted,



ERIC L. MASCHOFF  
Attorney for Applicant  
Registration No. 36,596  
Customer No. 022913  
Telephone: (801) 533-9800

ELM:kjb  
KJB0000004388V001